



**SUNY EMPIRE
STATE COLLEGE**

SUNY Empire State College

OPEID number: 01028600

Contact person:

Dr. Nan L. Travers

1 Union Ave.

Saratoga Springs, NY 12966

April 18, 2016

U.S. Department of Education

Jamienne S. Studley, Deputy Under Secretary

Assistant Secretary for Postsecondary Education

Dear Madam Deputy Under Secretary,

SUNY Empire State College seeks to participate in the Educational Quality through Innovative Partnerships (EQUIP) experiment to develop a new 24-credit certificate program that will directly transfer into associate and bachelor's degree programs and to employment in web development. This activity will use the Title IV Student Aid Program Choice: Eligibility for Pell Grants, undergraduate Direct Subsidized Loans and Direct Unsubsidized Loans, and the Campus-Based Programs.

The activity partners are:

Web Development Certificate

Higher Education: SUNY Empire State College

Non-Traditional Training Provider: Flatiron School

Quality Assurance Entity: American National Standards Institute (ANSI)

Estimated Number of Title IV-Eligible Students: Initially 30 students

Enclosed you will find the responses to the round-two application questions for SUNY Empire State College, the non-traditional training providers and the quality assurance entities. We are totally in support of these activities and hope to be involved in this exciting and important experiment.

Sincerely,

A black rectangular redaction box covering the signature of Dr. Alfred Ntoko.

Dr. Alfred Ntoko, Provost
Vice President for Academic Affairs

A black rectangular redaction box covering the signature of Kristina Delbridge.

Kristina Delbridge
Director of Financial Aid

Educational Quality through Innovative Partnerships (EQUIP) Round Two Application

Question 1.A.1

Response: SUNY Empire State College is partnering with the non-traditional training provider **Flatiron School** and the quality assurance entity **American National Standards Institute (ANSI)** to develop a **Web Development Certificate** (24 Credits).

The Web Development Certificate is new and will be developed as part of this experiment. The college has a policy that 50% of the credits for a certificate must be taken at the institution; therefore, the certificate will consist of 50% institutional credit and 50% non-traditional provider credits. The certificate will fully transfer into an associate and/or bachelor's degree at the college. The certificate is to be developed upon acceptance into the EQUIP experiment. At that point, the certificate will undergo established procedures for implementing new certificate programs. See Appendix A for a description of the proposed curriculum and Appendix B for Program Outcomes and Articulation Tables.

In addition to the academic certificate awarded by SUNY Empire State College, Flatiron School students will also receive the following credentials:

- *Professional Portfolio*: Key to employment in the field of web development is a professional portfolio. Students will graduate with a robust portfolio of work which will include individual and team-based projects (consisting of full-scale web applications that are deployed to the web, fully showcasing each student's range of abilities), and a live technical blog, detailing the students' progress through the curriculum.
- *GitHub Profile*: GitHub (www.github.com) has become the defacto resume for the software development industry. Students will create a transparent, and fully inspectable credential that matches the way employers in the field currently evaluate talent.

Question 1.A.2.

Response: The Web Development Certificate will have **well-defined, measurable learning outcomes** that integrate existing learning outcomes developed by Flatiron School and those developed by SUNY Empire State College their courses (see Appendix B for proposed learning outcomes). The certificate development process will use the Global Learning Qualifications Framework (www.esc.edu/suny-real/global-learning-qualifications-framework) and the Beta Credentials Framework (www.connectingcredentials.org) to ensure that the certificates have well-defined overall learning outcomes that are cohesive as a program and are stackable to associate and bachelor's degrees.

The certificate will be designed to transfer fully into associate and/or bachelor's degrees (See Appendix B for transfer articulation table); **academic transfer credit** will be tracked within SUNY Empire State College. **Job placement data** will be collected for the certificate program. These data are already collected by Flatiron School. For example, through an independent audit Flatiron School has shown a 99% graduation rate (n=246) with a 98% job-placement rate. For

the web development certificate, the goal will be to maintain a 90% graduation rate, and place 90% of students in technical jobs within 180 days of program completion.

Question I.A.3. Bullet 1

Response: The certificate will have two parts: the curriculum offered by Flatiron School and the curriculum offered by SUNY Empire State College. The certificate will be offered through courses, with core courses taught by Flatiron School and the supporting courses by SUNY Empire State College. All courses offered by Empire State College are 4-credits each and will be offered by the semester.

SUNY Empire State College is one of the seven institutional members of the Consortium for the Assessment of College Equivalencies (CACE). The consortium has created standards by which non-collegiate, professional learning conducted by non-traditional training providers is evaluated for college credit. These standards follow a similar process to evaluations conducted by the American Council on Education (ACE) and the National College Credit Recommendation Service (NCCRS). Planned is a similar process to evaluate the Web Development training conducted by Flatiron School for college credit.

The courses at SUNY Empire State College are term-based. There are five overlapping terms within the academic year (September, November, January, March, May, July). Minimally, the college courses will be offered for the fall and spring terms, but some courses may also be available during all five terms. All terms are 15 weeks long. Students have the option of taking the courses online or in-person modalities and individually or in group study formats. Some courses maybe offered in cohort residency format, as well.

Flatiron School offers the web development training as a linear progression of course modules to be completed over approximately 800 hours of total coursework. Admissions will be done on a rolling basis and students will be expected to complete the course within 12 months of enrollment, though based on historical data from Flatiron School, average completion is expected to be 7 months. The program will be offered on-line or through their Manhattan, NY facility.

Question I.A.3. Bullet 2

Response:

The Web Development Certificate will be 24 semester credit hours and will be structured to be completed within 1-year with full-time enrollment. Student will be able to attend part-time, in which case completion will take longer than a year. Each program will be tracked using credit hours. The Web Development training will be evaluated for college -level credits using the process as described above (see Question I.A.3. Bullet 1).

Federal satisfactory academic progress requirement will be calculated and tracked in the same way that all academic programs are calculated and tracked at the college for federal aid purposes. As well, the students will be monitored to ensure that the 150% rule will be enforced due to the length of the program for good academic standing.

Question I.A.3. Bullet 3

Response: SUNY Empire State College offers its courses in face-to-face, online or residency modalities. It has the ability to be flexible on its delivery based on student needs. Flatiron School offers its training both online and face-to-face. The Web Development Certificate will be available in both face-to-face and online modalities. Residency formats can be developed based on cohort and student needs.

Both deliveries offer student and instructional supports; the online delivery provides live support both synchronously and asynchronously. The program is designed to be entirely competency based to allow students to progress at the pace at which they attain mastery, while those who struggle receive supports necessary to continue learning and be successful.

Question I.A.3. Bullet 4

Response: The Web Development Certificate will be designed to integrate the learning acquired through Flatiron School and college courses into an academic credential. SUNY Empire State College faculty will work with Flatiron School to ensure that the certificate has market value and meets academic standards for higher education. The proposed curriculum consists of core courses taught through Flatiron School and general learning courses taught by SUNY Empire State College that enable the certificate in its entirety to transfer into an associate or bachelor's degree, and meet some of the SUNY General Education requirements (See Appendix A).

The college will use three frameworks to evaluate the learning at a college-level and to align the learning into stackable credentials. The Global Learning Qualifications Framework (GLQF) was developed through a Lumina Foundation grant and is designed to evaluate learning acquired outside of the traditional learning environment for college level credits (www.esc.edu/suny-real/global-learning-qualifications-framework). The Degree Qualifications Profile (DQP; www.degreeprofile.org), funded by the Lumina Foundation, will be used to align the certificates to expected overall outcomes of associate and bachelor's degrees. The Beta Credentials Framework, developed as part of the Connecting Credentials initiative (www.connectingcredentials.org) funded by the Lumina Foundation and led by the Corporation for a Skilled Workforce, will be used to ensure alignment of the certificates' competencies within academic and industry expectations.

Question I.A.4

Response: Increased labor market value and transfer value. According to The Education Trust's newly released report, *Meandering Toward Graduation: Transcript Outcomes of High School Graduates (2016)*, only 8% of students successfully complete a full college- and career-prep curriculum. The Web Development Certificate is designed to provide students with both college and career oriented curriculum and is built to encourage job placement and transfer, while addressing students' needs for flexibility and personalization. The Flatiron School will deliver the core curriculum geared toward industry standards connected to real-world experiences, while SUNY Empire State College will provide the supporting curriculum that increases the transferability of the certificates into associate and/or bachelor's degrees.

Within the curriculum, specific attention is given to leading industry standards, while developing professional, academic, independent and lifelong learning skills. In the Web Development Certificate, students will have direct experiences by which to explore and build upon their learning. In addition, the certificate's curriculum will be based on three nationally recognized frameworks (GLQF, DQP, and Beta Credentials Framework) to ensure learning is at a college level and is stackable and transferable into academic degrees. The combination of industry standards, academic standards, and the use of a national frameworks provides cohesiveness across the curriculum that targets degree completion and job placement.

Flexibility and personalization. SUNY Empire State College offers its associate and bachelor's students the flexibility to design their degrees based on area of study competency-based guidelines. This allows students to use various prior learning combined with institutional learning to develop a degree that best meets their educational and occupational goals. The Web Development Certificate will be designed to align to the competency-based guidelines used for the associate and bachelor's degrees to ensure transferability and alignment of stackable credentials.

Rolling admissions for the non-traditional training provider enables students to start at any time, giving them flexibility to fit the program into their lives. Although the SUNY Empire State College courses are on a term basis, there are five starts in a year, increasing flexible scheduling. Every student at SUNY Empire State College has a faculty mentor who helps the students determine their degree plan, course schedule and any needed supports. The Flatiron School delivers extra support and advising to its students. As a result, each student will have personal attention and guidance.

Cost Savings. All active duty, military, guard, reservists and veterans are eligible for an SUNY Empire State College military tuition grant of \$20 per credit to offset their educational costs. The net tuition for military students is \$250 per credit. All fees, except services-related fees and residency fees for residency-based courses, are waived. All Partnership agreements include the benefit of \$25 waived for the orientation fee and a one-time \$100 Presidential Scholarship applied to the student's first term of enrollment in a degree or certificate program (as long as the student is enrolled past day 28 of the term). The cost of attending SUNY Empire State College is lower than the national average (\$6,470 compared to \$9,410, respectively).

The Web Development Certificate brings greater market value to students seeking a career in Web Development. Flatiron School has a proven track record of a 99% program completion rate and a 98% job placement rate (at an average salary of \$74K), based on an independent audit report in 2015. This program provides students with the knowledge, skills, and experience to obtain a Web Developer position. Graduates obtain a deep understanding of industry web programming requirements using different technologies, expanding employability opportunities beyond web development. Due to the nature of the technology industry, this program focuses heavily on students being able to teach themselves to enable them to maintain currency within the field. When compared to other certificate programs in web

development, the Flatiron School program offers extensive hands-on experiences, one-on-one faculty guidance, real-world applications, and advanced programming knowledge. This program is offered online, unlike any of the other certificates within the SUNY system. This program will maintain high graduation rates (90% or better) and high employment rates (90% or better).

Over the past four years, Flatiron School has developed a unique competency in training low-income students for roles in high paying jobs quickly and efficiently. As compared to other programs that currently exist, this program can be benchmarked against two categories: traditional institutions of higher education and coding bootcamps. Relative to traditional institutions of higher education, this program will target a significantly higher bar for outcomes in terms of graduation rate, job placement and average starting salary. Further, the program will be focused exclusively on students who aim to pursue a career in web development. The closest alternative with institutions of higher education is a four-year degree in computer science. While that credential may be valuable or necessary for certain roles in the field of software engineering, by focusing exclusively on web development this program will be significantly faster (1 yr. vs 4 yrs.) and more cost-effective for students both in terms of tuition and time to completion. Flatiron School is the only institution that has proven outcomes among low-income populations by delivering the NYC Web Development Fellowship through its partnership with New York City.

Question I.A.5

Response: According to the Bureau of Labor Statistics, a 2015 survey (<http://www.bls.gov/cps/>) indicated that individuals with certifications and licenses earned 34% higher wages and had a lower unemployment rate (2.7% compared to 6.1%) than those who did not hold such credentials. In addition, those employed more were likely to hold an active certification or license (25.5% compared to 12.7% unemployed and 6.1% not in the labor force) and of those were more likely to have advanced degrees (51.9%). The partnership between SUNY Empire State College and Flatiron School enables students to gain certifications and continue further in higher education, increasing their employability and earning power within their chosen field.

The national outlook for web development market demand is extremely promising, with the national 10-year projected growth estimated at 27% (www.onetonline.org; www.bls.gov). There is a well-documented skills-gap that exists in the technology industry, which has pushed employers to seek talent directly from non-traditional education sources. The entire rise of the “coding bootcamp” industry is a testament to that fact. An industry report conducted by Course Report, showed that the “coding bootcamp” industry grew nearly 300% from 2013 to 2014 and again from 2014 to 2015, serving over 16,000 students in 2015 (<https://www.coursereport.com/reports/2015-coding-bootcamp-market-size-study>). Course Report has estimated that between 2011 and 2020, over 1.4 Million computing jobs will be created, while the entire US Higher Education system will graduate only 400,000 Computer Science majors. This leaves a shortfall of over 1 Million jobs for which employers will be seeking talent. The industry demand and salaries maintains a reasonable cost/earnings ratio (see Section Quality Assurance Questions, question C.4. Bullets 1-3).

Question I.A.6 Bullet 1

Response: SUNY Empire State College tuition and fees, minus the partnership scholarship (see section I.A.4. ¶14) = ((tuition \$3,235 + fees \$283) - \$100 Presidential Scholarship for partnership students) = \$3,418. Flatiron's portion of the tuition for this program is \$12,000. Combined, the total cost for this program is \$15,418.

The certificate program is provided at a lower cost than other programs offered by Flatiron School. It also provides increased services. The tuition and fees are modeled directly after Flatiron's NYC Web Development Fellowship with the City of New York, as this program has shown to be incredibly successful with students from low income and diverse demographics (for more information on the program visit: www.flatironschool.com/nycfellowship or <http://www.techtalentpipeline.nyc/>).

Not only is this program offered at a lower price than Flatiron's full-tuition on campus program (which costs \$15,000), it also includes significantly more in the way of social, professional, and instructional support, as has been found necessary to ensure success with the targeted demographics (see Questions I.D. and I.E for more information on services and supports). This largely manifests itself in the inclusion of additional career support and instructional services, as well as dedicated social work resources, all determined to be critical for success with this population through the NYC Fellowship program. The career support and partnership development services provided by Flatiron has proven to be highly successful at job placements for its graduates (98%).

Flatiron School costs include:

- **Lead Instructor-** The lead instructor is responsible for all aspects of program oversight, management, and implementation. This includes management of all instructional and support staff, reporting, and individual student interventions as needed, in order to ensure students overall program success. Additionally, the Lead instructor works closely with the Career Services, Admissions, and Curriculum teams to ensure that admitted students are equipped to be successful, and that the material being taught is aligned to employer demand in real time.
- **Instructor-** Individual instructors take ownership over the ongoing success of a single cohort of students, providing assessments throughout the program, as well as individual mentorship and training through study groups and 1-on-1 meetings with students. They are responsible for making sure each student is meeting academic requirements according to pre-set milestones and maintaining student learning plans to ensure objectives are met.
- **Expert Support-** The expert support staff is tasked with being available to students online via the Learn.co platform to answer questions and provide technical guidance, much like office hours. This is provided to students 18 hours/day, 7 days/week, so that students with varying needs and schedules can still progress through the program at the pace best suited for them. This format allows Flatiron to match the availability of support to student demand and create a large net efficiency- the support network can

manage a larger number of concurrent students than an instructor, while ensuring that students have access to instructional support at any time.

- **Admissions & Enrollments** - The enrollments function plays a critical role in the success of the Flatiron program. Given that it is targeted towards students from low-income and non-traditional backgrounds, Flatiron relies on a robust admissions process to ensure that students entering the program will be successful both academically and then professionally upon graduation. Since entry into the program does not require any previous knowledge, the admissions staff is tasked with gauging students' motivation and grit by providing them with free training resources and assessing their progress throughout the application process.
- **Campus Facilities** - Students leverage the Flatiron campus and facilities for study groups, meetups, and individual meetings with instructors or employers throughout their enrollment.
- **Employer Partnerships** - A significant amount of energy goes into building employer partnerships in order to give students access to post-graduation employment opportunities. This is all the more important when working with students from nontraditional backgrounds. Flatiron has a team of people focused exclusively on this role and has found that a single person can open enough opportunities in a year to place 90 students into full-time roles.
- **Career Counselor** - Students from the target demographic need a significant amount of coaching in order to be successful in the job-search process. This includes everything from resume/cover letter review, to mock interviews, and ongoing interview pipeline management. Once students complete 80% of the curriculum, they begin working 1-on-1 with a career counselor on a weekly basis.
- **Social Worker** - Based on Flatiron's experience delivering the NYC Web Development Fellowship program a dedicated social worker is necessary in order to help support this demographic. The role involves helping students through social and economic issues that would otherwise prevent them from successfully completing the program. In the past for Flatiron students, this has involved filing for public assistance, obtaining food stamps, dealing with health and personal issues, etc.
- **Program Manager** - The program manager is responsible for administrative oversight of the program, including data collection and evaluation, quality assurance oversight, and ongoing reporting.
- **Learn.co License** - Learn.co is Flatiron's proprietary Learning Management system, which allows for all content delivery and houses Flatiron's open-sourced curriculum. It is the primary mechanism by which students access curriculum and interact with instructors. Flatiron works with Universities (directly and through distribution via partners like Pearson) and corporations to provide access to training via this LMS. In order to increase accessibility, Flatiron has applied a significant (67%) discount off its public price.
- **Events** - In order to aid in students entering the workforce, Flatiron plans events throughout the course of a student's enrollment. These include meetups, networking events, and "employer speed dating" events, all designed to integrate students into the

technical community and open doors that would otherwise not be accessible to them given their lack of education and professional background.

Question I.A.6 Bullet 2

Response: The Web Development Certificate will be open to all students. Since student aid is dependent upon individual circumstances, an exact award determination is not possible. However, the average award at SUNY Empire State College for the past four years (2010-2014) are: \$2552, \$2120, \$2214, and \$2260, respectively – creating an overall average of \$2286 award. Using this figure, the expected net price for the students after grants is: \$15,418 - \$2286 = \$13,132

Question I.A.7

Response: Flatiron School is a for-profit entity.

Question I.A.8

Response: The Web Development Certificate is a new program. There are no existing programs that will be adapted for the proposed program.

Question I.B.1.

Response: The estimated number of students in the Web Development Certificate is 100 students. This is based on past enrollment trends at Flatiron School.

Question I.B.2.

Response: SUNY Empire State College has a diverse student body. The certificate program will be available to all its students; therefore, certificate programs should reflect a similar demographic. The expected percent of Pell-eligible students is 46%. This would translate into 46 students for the certificate program based on the estimated number above in question I.B.1.

Table I: Current Student Demographics at SUNY Empire State College and Non-Traditional Training programs

	Race/Ethnicity	Age range	Gender	Prior Education
SUNY Empire State College Combined average for 2012-13 (n=18,406) 2013-14 (n=18,109)	White = 67% Black/African American = 15% Asian = 2% American/Alaskan Native = 1% Hawaiian/Pacific Islander = 1% Multi-racial 1% Unknown = 13%	Average age 35.7 yrs ≤ 25 = 20% 25-29 = 18% 30-39 = 27% 40-49 = 22% 50+ = 14%	39% Male 61% Female	High School or GED only = 15% for Associate Degrees and 2% for Bachelor’s degrees Some College or prior degree = 85% for Associate Degrees and 98% for Bachelor’s Degrees
Flatiron School	Information not captured for general program. The NYC Web Development Fellowship over 80% of the students are from diverse backgrounds	18-30 years = 90% 10% over 30	39% Female 61% Male	

Question I.B.3.

Response: Based on 2014-2015 data, about 46% of the SUNY Empire State College student population will receive Title IV aid. The veteran and military population at the college is about 10%, based on current students who receive Veteran’s educational benefits. The college estimates that the total proportion in the certificate program will reflect that of the overall student body.

Question I.C.

Response: Students will have the option to pursue Pell Grants as well as undergraduate Direct Subsidized Loan, undergraduate Direct Unsubsidized Loans, and aid from the Campus-Based Programs.

Question I.D.

Response: There are multiple expected benefits to students who complete the program:

1. **Transfer Credit** – the certificate program will be totally transferrable into associate and bachelor’s degrees (see Appendix A). SUNY Empire State College is part of the State University of New York system, the largest higher education system in the country, and adheres to the SUNY Seamless Transfer Policy providing greater transfer abilities across the 64 SUNY institutions.
2. **Certifications Earned** –The Web Development Certificate provides students with industry credentials that help them obtain employment in their field. The Web Development students will also complete with a Professional Portfolio and a GitHub Profile, both of which are critical in the field for employment.
3. **Employment Opportunities** – The Flatiron School has impressive employment rates for its graduates. Based on industry data made publicly available by Course Report (<https://www.coursereport.com/reports/2015-coding-bootcamp-job-placement-demographics-report>), the average student sees a 38% increase in salary (equating to \$18,000 per year) upon graduating from a coding bootcamp. Seventy-nine percent of students enter with a college degree, and 66% of graduates are successfully employed upon graduation. This includes data from over 50 such programs. However, Flatiron School’s rates are much higher; based on an independent audit report (<http://FlatironSchools.com/jobs-report-2015>), Flatiron School students have a job placement rate of 98% with \$75,000 (+) starting salary.

Question I.E.

Response: Development and administration of the program will be a joint effort between SUNY Empire State College and Flatiron School for the certificate program. Responsibilities will be divided in a way that leverages the unique expertise of each partner in order to attain the best possible outcomes. Specifically:

- *Content & Curriculum Development* – Flatiron School is responsible for the content development of its respective training, in conjunction with industry and academic standards and input. SUNY Empire State college is responsible for content development of its courses offered in the certificate. SUNY Empire State College will be responsible for developing coherent, integrated curricula for the certificate with feedback from Flatiron School and its industry partners.

- *Marketing* – SUNY Empire State College and Flatiron School will be co-responsible for marketing to students. Information about the program will be linked to each website and brochure materials will be developed. College recruiters will promote the certificate program at various events.
- *Student Advising* – SUNY Empire State College and Flatiron School will be co-responsible for advising students on academics and support services. Every student at the college is assigned a faculty mentor who guides the students through degree planning and academic and student supports. Flatiron School will also offer student advising, especially focused on successful completion of the program resulting in employment.
- *Instructional Support* – SUNY Empire State College and Flatiron School will be co-responsible for the instructional support of students. In addition to faculty providing additional academic support, the college has academic support services, including tutors at the 35 locations of the college and contracted on-line academic support services. Students also have access to their instructors at each of the non-traditional training providers for instructional support. Flatiron School also provides instructional support to all students, which means that students are carefully monitored and supported throughout their academic program.
- *Career Support* – SUNY Empire State College and Flatiron School will be co-responsible for career support. The college has a full-time career coordinator who provides students with career counseling and placement. At Flatiron School, students will be assigned career coaches for support and job placement as they near graduation. During the program, those coaches will assist students in preparing for the transition to the workforce by helping students work through Flatiron School’s job placement curriculum.
- *Social Services* – SUNY Empire State College provides a variety of students services from disability services to counseling services. There are additional services for veteran and military students and their families. Flatiron School provides advising to students for a wide range of issues, such as those related to healthcare, welfare services, and family-related obligations. The goal of these services is to connect students with whatever government and social services exist that may aid them in overcoming obstacles to complete the program successfully.
- *Instructional Services* – SUNY Empire State College and Flatiron School will be co-responsible for instructional services; each for their portion of the curriculum through their faculty. The college faculty will oversee the certificate curriculum and ensure the quality and integrity of the program. The faculty from SUNY Empire State College and Flatiron School will coordinate efforts to ensure an integrated curriculum across the courses. In addition, student progress will be monitored closely across the curriculum to ensure success.
- *Assessments* – SUNY Empire State College and Flatiron School will be co-responsible for the assessment of student learning. As part of the requirement of the CACE standards and those used by ACE and NCCRS, any non-traditional training provider must assess student learning outcomes that are measurable and can be equated to college-level learning. The college faculty and ANSI will review the assessments as part of the program development to ensure that they meet standards of quality necessary for credit attainment.

- *Student Outcome Collection/Validation* – SUNY Empire State College and Flatiron School will be co-responsible for collecting the assessment results and validation of student academic and employment outcomes. Each of the partners will be responsible for reporting data on students’ progress throughout the program, such as enrollment date, assessment results, time-to-completion, and program completion requirements. These data will be regularly maintained and presented to ANSI to ensure ongoing compliance with learning standards. In addition, student-level data on employment outcomes, including time to placement from graduation, employer name, job title, and starting salary will be collected and reported as part of the program. Flatiron School will also continue to engage 3rd party auditors for independent validation of its outcome data (see (<http://Flatiron Schoolschool.com/jobs-report-2015>)).
- *Financial Assistance* – SUNY Empire State College will be responsible for advising students regarding federal financial aid and assisting them to acquire appropriate aid if eligible. Additional grant information may be available to students through Flatiron School. Flatiron School has had a fellowship for low-income students through New York City Department of Small Business Services (see question I.G. for more details) and will continue to seek fellowship opportunities for its students.

Question I.F.

Response: The institution will not be providing payment to Flatiron School.

Question I.G.

Response: Data will be collected on all students who participate in the Web Development Certificate program, including academic outcomes, persistence and completion, financial need and types of financial support, and gainful employment data.

Flatiron School has successfully served low-income students in a variety of capacities, most notably through its NYC Web Development Fellowship program. The NYC Web Development Fellowship was launched in 2013 as a partnership between the NYC Department of Small Business Services (under the banner of the “NYC Tech Talent Pipeline”) and Flatiron School in order to determine if Flatiron School could achieve the same results with low-income populations as with tuition-paying students in its traditional programs.

In its first year, the Fellowship enrolled 56 students, all of whom were NYC residents from low-income backgrounds that possessed significant barriers to training or employment. The program was extended for another year, expanding to 64 students, targeting the same population, but specifically students without a four-year college degree. Today the Fellowship is one of NYC’s most dramatic workforce development programs. In its current iteration, it is serving exclusively foreign-born New Yorkers, again targeting the same incredible outcomes, discussed below. Additionally, NYC has expanded the program to include training for 120 New Yorkers in iOS (mobile app) development with the recent launch of the Mobile Dev Corps, again in partnership with Flatiron School (www.flatironschool.com/mobiledevcorps). To date, the Fellowship has seen remarkable success, with students seeing 98% job placement, over \$75,000 annual salaries at over 50 different companies.

In order to successfully achieve the same outcomes with this new population, Flatiron School modified its traditional program in three key areas: Technical Training by increasing the hours, Professional Development by addressing employability outcomes, and implementing Social Services referral processes.

Question I.H.

Response: SUNY Empire State College serves a very non-traditional population; the mean age was 36.4 years for the Fall 2009 cohort, for which there is 6-year completion data available. The Fall 2009 completion data for first-time, full-time freshman indicate they are one of the smallest populations: 9.4% or 210 students of new student population (n=2840, includes first-time and transfer students, full-time and part-time). Of these first-time, full-time freshman the 6-year graduation rate was: 23.3% (n=49) for those who received Pell; 36.0% (n=9) for those who received subsidized loans; and 16.7% (n=5) for those with no Pell or subsidized loans. For the full Fall 2009 cohort 6-year completion data (n= 2,840 students), 40.79% (n=1,162) received Pell, while 47.74% (n=1,678) were non-Pell recipients.

Question I.I.

Response: All students have access to academic and student support services (see question I.E.). Students in the Web Development Certificate program will have access to the same support services; there is no need to adapt any of the current services. Certificate program students have the additional advantage of working with the Flatiron School's faculty and staff, as well as those at the college. Therefore, the certificate students have access to additional services through Flatiron School that provide further monitoring and supports to ensure success. Flatiron School is closely connected to industry, providing students with increased supports to obtain employment.

Question I.J.

Response: The institution will award Campus-Based aid for the certificate program in the same manner as it does for all eligible students; Pell Grants and other title IV Aid is awarded based on need. This is also consistent with the experiment's focus on access for low-income students. The college will continue to award Direct Loans before Perkins. Students may pursue Federal Work Study, which is awarded on a first come, first serve basis as is our policy. Federal Supplemental Education Opportunity Grants (SEOG) will continue to be awarded to those who have a zero Estimated Family Contribution (EFC).

Question II.A.

Response: The American National Standards Institute (ANSI; www.ansi.org) will be the quality Assurance Entity to evaluate the Web Development Certificate.

Question II.A.1.

Response: ANSI is nationally known for its experience, expertise and skills to address the quality assurance requirements of this project. ANSI is a founding member of the International Accreditation Forum (IAF), the International Organization for Standardization (ISO), and, via the

U.S. National Committee (USNC), the International Electrotechnical Commission (IEC). The Institute participates in the activities of regional standardization and accreditation cooperatives such as the Pacific Accreditation Cooperation (PAC).

In 2009, the American National Standards Institute launched a Certificate Accreditation Program (ANSI-CAP) to accredit organizations that issue a wide variety of education and training certificates to the U.S. workforce. ANSI-CAP provides neutral, third-party attestation that a given certificate program meets an American National Standard and provides quality benchmarks for the design of future certificate programs. With this program in place, employers and workers alike are able to know the value of a certificate, helping to boost the overall quality of the American workforce.

The Web Development Certificate program will be evaluated for potential accreditation against the standard ASTM E2659-09, Standard Practice for Certificate Programs. This American National Standard developed by ASTM International was selected by the ANSI-CAP Accreditation Committee, a group of volunteer leaders who were chosen for their expertise in the field. By demonstrating compliance to this standard, the certificate program will further the development of a well-educated and qualified workforce. ANSI-CAP will also follow the accreditation process outlined in the International Standard ISO/IEC 17011, General Requirements for Accreditation Bodies Accrediting Conformity Assessment Bodies. This process includes using specially trained assessors to review documents submitted by applicants against defined requirements, conduct on-site assessments of all applicants, and make recommendations to the ANSI-CAP Accreditation Committee that is responsible for making the accreditation decisions.

Question II.A.2.

Response:

The American National Standards Institute (ANSI) has set procedures for the monitoring (Surveillance and Reassessment) of programs. The following are excerpts from ANSI's Surveillance and Reassessment Procedure document:

Under [CAP-PR-316, Surveillance and Reassessment Procedure](#), Clause 3.1:

Continuing accreditation assessment activities (surveillance) will be conducted every year, 12 months after the date of initial accreditation, with the purpose of:

- a) determine that the certificate issuer continues to operate in conformity with ANSI requirements and the requirements of ASTM E2659-09;
- b) determine that the certificate issuer continues to operate as described in the documentation governing the program;
- c) determine if any major changes reported have affected the conformity of the program to ASTM E2659-09 or ANSI requirements.

Under [CAP-PR-316, Surveillance and Reassessment Procedure](#), Clause 3.2:

Continuing accreditation activities shall include but not be limited to:

- a) headquarters assessment of selected requirements (ASTM E2659-09) and/or satellite sites, if applicable;
- b) other visits and assessments needed to confirm that the program is in conformance as set forth in the program documents approved by ANSI and in accordance with ANSI requirements;

- c) assessments of the certificate issuer functions to ensure that the systems and personnel operations continue to be in conformity with the program document(s) approved by ANSI;
- d) submission of an annual surveillance self-report report as determined by the ANSI accreditation program.

[CAP-PL-301, Accreditation Policy for ANSI Certificate Accreditation Program](#), Clause 10.7:

ANSI may conduct extraordinary assessment(s) on accredited Certificate Issuers for the following reasons:

- a) significant organizational changes;
- b) request for scope extension;
- c) increased certificate training activity;
- d) severity and/or multitude of non-conformities identified during previous assessments;
- e) complaints received against the subject Certificate Issuer;
- f) relationships that cause real or perceived conflicts of interest;
- g) other conditions deemed appropriate by the Accreditation Committee Evaluation Task Group (ETG).

The ANSI Accreditation process consists of the following steps: a preliminary application, full application, and document review whereby all items are assessed by CAP standards; followed by an On-site Assessment. After the assessment, any corrective action that must be taken by the applicant on one or more requirements can take place. Once the applicant has closed nonconformities to the satisfaction of the ANSI assessment team, the details of the assessment will be presented to the CAP Accreditation Committee for deliberation and an ultimate decision on initial accreditation. Accreditation is granted by the CAP Accreditation Committee and the Accredited Certificate Issuer operates their program in accordance with ANSI requirements as well as the relevant CAP program policies and procedures. Surveillance of accredited certificate issuer provides confidence about the full implementation and effectiveness of the Certificate Issuer. Furthermore, regular surveillance intends to assure stakeholders of the quality of the services provided. Surveillance occurs every year annually at the date of initial accreditation.

Question II.A.3.

Response: The Web Development Certificate has not previously been reviewed by ANSI. Once accepted into the EQUIP experiment, SUNY Empire State College will follow its required procedures to formally develop the program, which includes approval at the college, SUNY-system, New York State Department of Education (NYSED), and Middle States Commission on Higher Education (MSCHE) levels. As part of this approval process, ANSI will begin their review of the program based on the Quality Assurance Questions.

Question II.A.4.

Response: ANSI will monitor and report on the performance of the program. Flatiron School will collaborate regularly with SUNY Empire State College to exchange information with regard to the results. SUNY Empire State College will report on student outcomes as requested by ANSI. Quarterly conference call meetings will facilitate the exchange of information to include any indications that the program is at risk or, or subject to, any adverse action by any party. As part of these updates, ANSI will share information on a regular basis regarding any complaints by students enrolled in the program. If deficiencies are determined, ANSI will coordinate with

SUNY Empire State College and Flatiron School to identify the appropriate course of action, including whether or not Flatiron School and/or the certificate program continues to have ANSI's approval for its courses. If necessary, MSCHE, NYSED, and SUNY will be informed of any concerns that are not resolved or are egregious in nature.

In the case of any complaints regarding the program or review process, ANSI will address the issues through SUNY Empire State College's and MSCHE's complaint policies and procedures (for MSCHE see <http://www.msche.org/documents/ComplaintsInvolvingMemberCandidate.PDF>). Overall complaints regarding the certificate program and its outcomes would be addressed through SUNY Empire State College's Office of Academic Affairs and/or the Office of the President. For specific issues, the college has policies and procedures in place, depending on the complaint: e.g., student service contacts for problem resolution (<http://www.esc.edu/collegewide-student-services/contact-for-support/problem-resolution-contacts/>); student academic appeals policy and procedures (<http://www.esc.edu/policies/?search=cid=37972>); and student complaint policy (<http://www.esc.edu/policies/?search=cid%3D37969>). There are also policies for employees, such as the discrimination complaint policy and sexual discrimination policy. All college policies are posted on the website and are available to the public.

ANSI's reporting procedures are explained in [CAP-PL-301, Accreditation Policy for ANSI Certificate Accreditation Program](#), clauses 8.1, 8.2, 8.3, 10.2, and 10.5, subsequent to the onsite assessment, lead assessors shall prepare appropriate reports in accordance with the CAP procedures. These reports shall document the assessments conducted and include references to any non-conformities or opportunities for improvements identified. The reports shall be provided to the applicant Certificate Issuer with an invitation to comment on their factual accuracy. The Certificate Issuer shall be required to provide the proposed corrective action plans and submit evidence of implementation of these plans for the non-conformities identified. Assessors shall review the corrective actions and provide their responses to the applicant. ANSI may require that subsequent follow-up assessment(s) are conducted based on such factors as severity of the non-conformities identified or the timeframe in which the corrective actions were implemented. Surveillance assessment of the accredited Certificate Issuer shall be conducted in accordance with the CAP procedures every year besides the year in which the CI undergoes reassessment. The purpose of surveillance assessments is to monitor the continued compliance of accredited CIs with appropriate ANSI policies. ANSI requires the Certificate Issuer to propose the corrective action plan and a target implementation date within a limited timeframe for all non-conformities identified during reassessment and surveillance activities.

Question II.A.5.

Response: As indicated earlier, SUNY Empire State College uses the CACE standards and their own set procedures for assessing non-traditional training programs for college credit. Flatiron School's Web Development training will be evaluated prior to the start of the certificate program. The college re-evaluates external training programs every five years, unless changes are made to the curriculum. If changes are made, the training program is re-evaluated and

credits adjusted based on the findings. If less or more credits are determined, the college will adjust the certificate curriculum to maintain its quality. The certificate programs will follow standard college procedures for evaluation of learning outcomes and program effectiveness that aim to meet expectations of the U.S. Department of Education, the State University of New York (SUNY) and the Middle States Commission on Higher Education (<http://www.esc.edu/decision-support/>). The results of these assessments will be used to improve the programs.

ANSI will evaluate the program's, providers' and students' performance outcomes through systematic and established processes (see Question II.A.4). If changes in the program curriculum and/or processes or if issues arise with any of the constituents, ANSI will work with the college and Flatiron School to resolve the concerns. ANSI will use its established criteria to evaluate and make suggestions for improvement. In addition to regular planned evaluations, ANSI will also assess the certificate program when situations arise, such as: significant organizational changes; request for scope extension; increased certificate training activity; severity and/or multitude of non-conformities identified during any assessment process, such as not meeting the standards; inability to transfer any credit earned; low student completion or retention; complaints received against the subject Certificate Issuer; relationships that cause real or perceived conflicts of interest; misrepresenting the nature of the curriculum; and/or any other conditions deemed appropriate by ANSI. In cases when the program doesn't meet the ANSI's standards at any point of the assessment process, a warning will be issued that includes the reasons for the warning and the corrective action that must be taken in order to maintain reviewed status. Critical issues or unresolved issues will result in a notification to MSCHE, NYSED, and SUNY (see Question II.A.4).

Question II.B.

Response: If the certificate program is suspended, terminated, or otherwise limited in its participation by any of the program constituents there will be full transfer of credits (either the certificate as a whole or individual courses) into associate and bachelor's degrees at the college. The Web Development trainings offered through Flatiron School will be pre-evaluated for credit. This means that those credits can be used in any degree program at SUNY Empire State College, regardless if students participate in the certificate program or not. That also means if the certificate program is limited in part or completely, the credits are still valid for transfer.

In the event that SUNY Empire State College was to discontinue this program and enter into a teach out agreement with another institution, the college would work with that institution to develop an agreed upon Cost of Education that is fair to the students who are affected. The college would inform the students of their options and explain that their use of Pell grant and loan monies will count against the annual and aggregate borrowing limits under the program except in the case where a student loan discharge may be warranted. The college would seek guidance from its School Participation Team to ensure that the college is acting appropriately and meeting compliance requirements.

Question II.C.

Response: The procedures that SUNY Empire State College uses to evaluate non-traditional training clearly states that content experts used in addition to college faculty cannot have a conflict of interest with the evaluated entity. The ANSI document, [ANSI-PR-030, Confidentiality and Conflict of Interest](#) provides procedures to be followed by all ANSI "Accreditation Team Members" to avoid conflicts of interest and ensure client confidentiality in the accreditation process. SUNY Empire State College, Flatiron School and ANSI are completely independent of each other in ownership and do not share funding or staffing.

Question II.D.

Response: SUNY Empire State College, Flatiron School and ANSI have all indicated that they conduct extensive background checks on all new employees, which includes checking for felony convictions. In addition, verification of education and previous employment is conducted and references are checked. All of the constituents are in good legal standing and have no past history of fraud, commission of a felony, disbarment or liability for negligence or misrepresentation. SUNY Empire State College will require all constituents involved to sign a statement as such as part of the contract for this project.

Question III.1.

Response: Yes

Question III.2.

Response: No

Question III.3.

Response: The Web Development Certificate will be offered completely online and in-person. SUNY Empire State College will also offer the corresponding course for the certificate requirements online to provide 100% web-based access to the first two certificate programs and face-to-face to provide flexibility for students. The college and Flatiron will take care to ensure regular and substantial interactions with the students throughout the course. SUNY Empire State College has a 3-page document for all faculty who teach online that specifies the expectations for regular and substantial interactions. By policy, SUNY Empire State College online faculty must:

1. Maintain regular social and teaching presence to create a positive online learning community.
2. In accordance with College policy, provide substantive and timely feedback on discussions and academic work submitted by the student as specified in the time frame for formative feedback in the course's Learning Contract.
3. Facilitate student-to-student discussion to enhance individual learning.
4. Stimulate reflection and critical thinking on the part of the student.
5. Encourage the student to engage with the material and produce his/her best work.
6. Acquaint students with excellence in the field helping him/her learn to judge quality of his/her own work.
7. Help the student make relevant connections between the course work and his/her personal and professional interests and experience.
8. Extend the learning beyond the course material where appropriate.
10. Satisfactorily bring the course to closure and submit outcomes in a timely fashion.

Students are provided with a course syllabus that outlines requirements and expectations for successful course completion. Learning Management Systems (LMS) are used by both SUNY Empire State College and Flatiron School to provide online learning environments and track student progress and interactions. The following are examples of how regular and substantial interactions are provided and tracked:

- Attendance – each course takes attendance for each meeting session. Articulated attendance expectations are part of the course completion requirements.
- Assignments – each course has well established assignments that are part of the course materials available to all students. These assignments are an integral part of the online sessions, along with set expectations for online interactions as part of the course requirements. Some assignments are purposefully designed to engage the students in hands-on, experiential activities that are then integrated into the online discussions.
- Discussions – each course is built around regular, interactive discussions with the faculty and other students that are tracked and part of the completion requirements of the courses.
- Feedback – Regular interactions and feedback from the faculty are integrated into the courses. For example, Flatiron School’s faculty are continuously interacting and providing feedback, which is essential for student progress. SUNY Empire State College provides similar monitoring and interaction by the faculty.
- Portfolio – Flatiron School requires students to develop a portfolio of their work as part of the expected outcomes of the program.

Question IV.

Response: See Appendix C for letters of commitment from Flatiron School and from Middle State Commission on Higher Education.

Quality Assurance Question A.1. Bullets 1 & 2

Response: The certificate program will have clearly articulated learning outcomes. The assessments of the student learning are aligned to these outcomes. The curriculum (including the learning outcomes) are reviewed at many levels prior to approval.

To develop a certificate program, SUNY Empire State College uses a faculty review process to develop the curriculum, which includes vetting by the providers and undergoing internal ‘checks and balance’ reviews through governance and the college as a whole. In addition, prior to implementing the certificate, it must be reviewed and approved by SUNY and NYSED, and to be included in this experiment, the certificate programs will also be reviewed by the college’s accreditation agency, MSCHE.

Prior to this curricular review, the Web Development training offered by Flatiron School will be reviewed to ensure the learning is commensurate with college-level learning. This process should be completed Fall 2016. The review is conducted by a team consisting of the college’s faculty and an outside expert not connected to the organization under review. These reviews are based on established documented college practice and the CACE standards, which are both aligned to the processes conducted by ACE and NCCRS.

The faculty committee that will develop the curriculum will use three national frameworks to ensure that learning outcomes/competencies are in alignment with college-level learning expectations and are transferable into associate and bachelor's degree levels (see questions I.A.2 and I.A.3 Bullet 4). In addition, the college programs are structured around 12 areas of study; for each, there are program-level learning outcomes/competencies that every degree must meet. The individual student degrees undergo four levels of reviews (individual faculty mentor, faculty curricular committee, professional staff, and administrative) to ensure the degrees meet the program outcomes and follow policy. Although the certificate will not undergo this extensive review as they will be structured curriculum, they will be scrutinized to ensure when transferred into an associate or bachelor's degree they meet program expectations in an upfront review (see Appendix A).

All programs undergo periodic review processes conducted by a separate college office (Decision Support) not associated with Academic Affairs. These reviews examine program effectiveness and learning outcomes for the program and general education (see <http://www.esc.edu/decision-support/> for the review process). The process uses established rubrics and faculty committees to assess student learning and program outcomes.

Quality Assurance Question A.2.

Response: Flatiron School has an advisory group to help establish and verify the curriculum that is offered. Outside groups have also evaluated the training. For example, in creating the NYC Web Development Fellowship program, Flatiron School underwent a significant amount of scrutiny in order to ensure that its curriculum met the needs of employers. As part of this process, the entire program had to be reviewed, in detail, and approved by the NYC Tech Talent Pipeline Advisory Board, which is comprised of 28 CEOs, CTOs, CIOs, and senior executives representing the city's top tech employers and a collective workforce of 40,000 New Yorkers. The curriculum has to undergo extensive reviews and approval process that are described in above in the Quality Assurance Question A.1. Bullets 1 & 2.

Quality Assurance Question A.3.

Response: Flatiron School and SUNY Empire State College have developed extensive assessments that measure learning from different perspectives and address the learning outcomes. Appendix B lists the expected outcomes from this program. Each course has a syllabus that outlines the expectations and assessment strategies. Examples of learning assessments include: written and online quizzes and tests, written reports, graded activities, summaries of experiential activities, direct observation reports (in f2f settings), oral interviews, and portfolio reviews. Flatiron also evaluates the students' GitHub profile. The faculty evaluate student learning using the learning outcomes and, in some cases, developed rubrics.

The results of the assessments will be part of ANSI's reviews. In addition, the internal SUNY Empire State College program assessment process examines samples of students' work and assessments used. Rubrics are used for this process that have been tested and verified through reliability and validity measures.

Quality Assurance Question A.4.

Response: Internally, every program at SUNY Empire State College undergoes periodic reviews conducted by the Decision Support office. The result of these reviews are given to the area of study faculty to make program improvements. The results are also shared with Academic Affairs and the undergraduate program governance committee. As students transfer the certificates into degree programs, the faculty review process also provides accountability and feedback to the area of study under which certificate programs fall.

Externally, ANSI will be reviewing the outcomes of the certificate and providing continuous feedback on results. In addition, the reporting conducted by Decision Support is shared with SUNY. Accreditation reviews also provide feedback and accountability to the programs.

Quality Assurance Question A.5.

Response: SUNY Empire State College uses multi-layered process to ensure that course outcomes lead to program outcomes. The college has overall learning goals that every program must meet (<http://www.esc.edu/policies/?search=cid%3D61278>). The college faculty are organized within 12 areas of study, for which different program outcomes and goals have been developed (see www.esc.edu/aos for each area of study guideline). Courses are developed with these program outcomes in mind, as each major course must support the acquisition of the program outcomes. Each student's program of study undergoes four levels of review (see Quality Assurance Question A.1. Bullets 1 & 2 for more details) to ensure it meets the program outcomes and goals and adheres to program policies. The certificate program in this application will align to the area of study guidelines, which will be used when designing the certificate. In addition, as previously mentioned, three national frameworks will be used to provide guidance as to how the certificate programs are cohesive and meaningful to industry and academic expectations. Flatiron School will provide guidance to ensure the certificates are meaningful within working environments.

Quality Assurance Question B.1. Bullets 1 & 2

Response: Student assessments are designed to measure the students' gain of learning outcomes. They are aligned with specific tasks, expectations and context of the program, the transfer degrees and employment in the field. Flatiron and SUNY Empire State College developed assessments will be reviewed by a faculty team as part of the curriculum development process. ANSI will review the assessments and samples of students' work as part of its review process. All students' work used during the review process will be redacted to remove any identifiable information to protect the privacy and identity of the students. As previously mentioned, the certificate program will also undergo review through the governance and academic review processes. It will be periodically reviewed through Decision Support, and as part of that review assessments and samples of students' work are also considered.

Students who are part of the Flatiron program will have portfolios as a program outcome. These portfolios will be assessed by Flatiron and college faculty, as well as can be made available to potential employers. Flatiron students also provide a GitHub, which is professionally reviewed as part of the employment seeking process.

Quality Assurance Question B.2.

Response: The reliability of the assessments has not yet been established as the certificate program is under development. However, the reliability measures of Flatiron School's training have some reliability indicators in terms of preparing students consistently over time for the workforce. Their results are emphasized in the independent audit report (<http://flatironschool.com/jobs-report-2015>).

Quality Assurance Question B.1. Bullets 1-4

Response: SUNY Empire State College's assessment model is linked to expectations established by the State University of New York (SUNY) first mandated in the late 1990's. Each SUNY institution developed an assessment plan detailing procedures and guidelines, as well as a timeline for implementation. The college determined that faculty review of authentic examples of student work was the most fitting methodology for directly assessing student learning outcomes. Two of the college's three assessment methods (Assessment in the Major (AITM) and the General Education Assessment Review) involve direct assessment of student learning. The third method, the Area of Study Review (AOSR), is a review of the degree portfolios of students who have recently graduated from the college, to assess how well the program design and documentation reflect relevant academic policies. The faculty teams use validated rubrics to assess student work; the results provide validity to the assessments.

Flatiron School has indicated that their assessments are valid for the workforce. These assessments will be reviewed by the college for face, content, and concurrent validity. The predictive validity cannot be determined until the program is established and resulting outcomes measured. Once the programs are established, further validity studies can provide additional verification of student learning. ANSI will evaluate the assessment process for validity, as well.

Quality Assurance Question B.4.

Response: ANSI policy states that Surveillance assessment of the accredited Certificate Issuer shall be conducted in accordance with the CAP procedures every year besides the year in which the Certificate Issuer undergoes reassessment. Surveillance assessment shall be less comprehensive than the initial assessments and reassessments. The surveillance assessment shall include a document review every year and onsite assessments during years one and three. If a need is determined by the assessors and confirmed by the CAPAC (Certificate Accreditation Program Accreditation Committee), ANSI shall also conduct onsite assessments in years two and four of the accreditation cycle.

Quality Assurance Question C.1.

Response: SUNY Empire State College and Flatiron School will provide ANSI with performance outcomes from the program assessments. The data will not contain student identifiable information, but a student id will be used as a field key. The performance data will be compared to other measures (see below) to determine the degree to which performance is related to retention, persistence and goal attainment.

Quality Assurance Question C.2. Bullets 1-4

Response: SUNY Empire State College and Flatiron School will provide ANSI with program outcomes as they relate to retention, withdrawal, and completion rates, and average time to completion. The data will not contain student identifiable information, but a student id will be used as a field key. These data will be compared to other measures (see above) to determine the degree to which performance is related to retention, persistence and goal attainment. In addition, the data will be examined to determine any milestone barriers to student persistence.

Quality Assurance Question C.3. Bullets 1-3

Response: Overall Program Outcomes for the Web Development Certificate Program (for specific program outcomes see Appendix B)

- Job Placement rates –90 %
- Average length of time between completion of program and employment in field of study – 120 days
- Job Retention rates (after 1 year) 90%
- Median Starting Salaries (with training) –\$74,000
- Transfer Rates – 90 % into an associate or bachelor’s degree

Quality Assurance Question C.4. Bullets 1-3

Response: The Web Development Certificate program is not yet implemented, so the ratios for the program have not yet been established. Data will be collected to establish these ratios in the future. Estimated ratios are as follows (based on provider reported average salaries):

- Published tuition and fees versus earnings: 20%
- Average net price versus earnings: WDC 18%
- Median student debt versus earnings: WDC 24%

Note: The median student debt is based on degree programs at the college. This will be the first certificate programs eligible for financial aid, therefore the estimated student debt would be much lower.

Quality Assurance Question C.3. Bullets 1-2

Response: SUNY Empire State College participates in the SUNY Student Opinion Survey. The college ranks first among all state-operated campuses in overall student satisfaction and has done so consistently at every administration of the survey since 1994. Students in the certificate program will be included in that survey. In addition, the college will administer a survey to students in the program and six-months post-graduation to determine satisfaction and collect suggestions for improvement. ANSI will interview a sample of students and report on satisfaction, as well.

Quality Assurance Question D.1

Response: Flatiron School has undergone an independent audit to determine how it is meeting its program outcomes. The school has been serving students since 2012 and has been evaluated by the City of New York in terms of its ability to deliver programs for low-income students. This

included an evaluation of Flatiron School's financial solvency and ability to deploy necessary resources towards the success of such programs as recently as late 2015. As part of the program review process that SUNY Empire State College will conduct, requires the review team to look at the longevity, past outcomes, leadership and stability of the organization.

Quality Assurance Question D.2

Response: All students fall under the college policies for FERPA and other policies that protect students' privacy (www.esc.edu/policies). In addition, the college abides by strict adherence to security of student data and is in partnership with the University of Albany to use the latest technologies for data storage, redundancy and security. All students are given a unique id number and a college email address. The combination of the two are used by students to authenticate for logging into student access webpages and the learning management system.

Flatiron School uses an internal database and learning management system. Again, students are provided with unique log-in information to access their information and courses. Student data will be shared from Flatiron to the college and ANSI through secure data exchange using only the ID as an identifier to protect students' personal information.

Quality Assurance Question D.3

Response: The Web Development Certificate program will be listed on SUNY Empire State College's and Flatiron School's websites. Brochures will be developed and shared widely with employment offices, high schools, selected HR departments, and industry events. The college recruiters will promote the program through their normal activities, such as job and college fairs and general information sessions. Flatiron School will also contribute to recruiting efforts.

Quality Assurance Question D.4

Response: The pricing of the Web Development Certificate program will be included on SUNY Empire State College's and Flatiron School's websites. All written brochure materials will also include pricing information. All certificate students will be given the cost of program information prior to enrollment. Flatiron School includes the pricing on their enrollment webpage, which is accepted by students prior to enrollment.

Quality Assurance Question D.5

Response: SUNY Empire State College has an office of disabilities with a full-time director and staff. The college offers a variety of services as indicated on this public college webpage, <http://www.esc.edu/disability-services/>. All students in the certificate program will access services through the college.

All new online course materials undergo an accessibility review that uses a checklist and rubric and comply with the WCAD 2.0 Level AA guidelines. Existing and updated web courses are placed on a periodic review that uses the same process. Courses administered in person are reviewed when a student is officially identified through the Office of Collegewide Disability Services following the same procedures. All certificate courses will follow the same procedures and be evaluated prior to offering the certificates.

Quality Assurance Question D.6

Response: Continuous improvement is part of the program assessment process. Feedback is gained through the college's and Flatiron School's advisory boards and industry needs. All programs at SUNY Empire State College undergo an extensive review process, which includes action items for improvement. The institutional accreditation process also provides input for improvement. ANSI will play an important role in the continuous improvement process. ANSI will provide feedback and recommended improvements. For details on the assessment and recommendation procedures see questions in Section II on Quality Assurance Processes.

References

- Bromberg, M., & Theokas, C. (2016). Meandering Toward Graduation: Transcript Outcomes of High School Graduates. The Education Trust, April 2016. <https://edtrust.org/resource/meandering-toward-graduation/>.
- Course Report (2015). 2015 Bootcamp Market Size Study. <https://www.coursereport.com/reports/2015-coding-bootcamp-market-size-study>.
- United States Census Bureau. <http://www.census.gov/quickfacts/table/PST045215/00,36001,36091>
- United States Department of Labor, Bureau of Labor Statistics (2015). Labor Force Statistics from the Current Population Survey. <http://www.bls.gov/cps/certifications-and-licenses.htm#highlights>.
- United States Department of Labor, Bureau of Labor Statistics (2016). Occupational Outlook Handbook. <http://www.bls.gov/ooh/home.htm>.
- United States Department of Labor, Employment and Training Administration, National Center for O*Net Development. www.onetonline.org.

Appendix A: Part I

Web Development Certificate Proposed Curriculum:

Source	Title	Credits
Flatiron School	Module A: Ruby Basics	2
Flatiron School	Module B: Object Orientation in Ruby	1
Flatiron School	Module C: Object Relational Mapping	1
Flatiron School	Module D: Introduction to Web Development with Rack and Sinatra	1
Flatiron School	Module E: Advanced Web Development with Rails	2
Flatiron School	Module F: Creating Interactive and Performant Front-Ends with Javascript	2
Flatiron School	Module G: Web Development Projects	3
Empire State College	College Writing	4
Empire State College	Math for the Inquiring Mind	4
Empire State College	Structured Problem Solving	4

Appendix B

1. Web Development Certificate

Area of Study: Science, Math and Technology/Information Systems Learning Outcomes

- a. Communication;
- b. Quantitative reasoning;
- c. Foundational learning;
- d. Databases;
- e. IT Infrastructure;
- f. Security;
- g. Professional, legal, and ethical responsibilities;
- h. Organizational understanding;
- i. Systems analysis and design;
- j. Project management;
- k. Relationship between IT and business.

Articulation Table:

Title	AOS Guide	Gen Ed	Lib/Non-Lib	LL/AL	AS/BS
Ruby Basics	C		Non Liberal	LL	●/●
Object Orientation in Ruby	C		Non Liberal	LL	●/●
Object Relational Mapping	D		Non Liberal	LL	●/●
Introduction to Web Development with Rack and Sinatra	D, E		Non Liberal	LL	●/●
Advanced Web Development with Rails	D, F		Non Liberal	AL	●/●
Creating Interactive and Performant Front-Ends with Javascript	C, E		Non Liberal	AL	●/●
Web Development Projects	I		Non Liberal	AL	●/●
College Writing	A	Basic Comm	Liberal	LL	●/●
Math for the Inquiring Mind	B	Math	Liberal	LL	●/●
Structured Problem Solving	B		Liberal	LL	●/●

SUNY Empire State College, Flatiron School and ANSI

Appendix C Letters of Commitment

Flatiron School

Middle States Commission on Higher Education



April 15, 2016

Dr. Merodie Hancock, President
SUNY Empire State College
2 Union Ave.
Saratoga Springs, NY 12866

Re: Educational Quality through Innovative Partnerships (EQUIP) Program

Dr. Hancock,

We are excited to be submitting an application in partnership with SUNY Empire State College in consideration for the Educational Quality through Innovative Partnerships (EQUIP) program. Should we be selected for the program, we are committed to offering the content and instruction described in the proposal once all required approvals are secured.

Regards,



Adam Enbar

CEO, Flatiron School



Middle States Commission on Higher Education

3624 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104-2680. Tel: 267-284-5000. Fax: 215-662-5501
www.msche.org

April 11, 2016

Dr. Merodie A. Hancock, President
SUNY Empire State College
One Union Avenue
Saratoga Springs, NY 12866

Dear President Hancock,

This will document agreement by the Middle States Commission on Higher Education to consider including, within the scope of accreditation for SUNY Empire State College, your institution's proposed work with the non-traditional provider(s) and quality assurance agencies listed below. This work, which is being developed as part of the U. S. Department of Education Experimental Sites Initiative, Educational Quality through Innovative Partnerships (EQUIP), will require Commission review and approval through the process of complex substantive change.

Name of Non-Traditional Provider(s)

Flatiron School



Quality Assurance Entity(ies)

American National Standards Institute (ANSI)



We wish you every success with these projects.

Sincerely,



Ellie A. Fogarty
Vice President

c: Dr. Marjorie W. Lavin, Vice Provost for Academic Services